

**State of Maine
Master Score Sheet**

RFA# 202302038					
Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs					
Applicant's Organization Name:		Maine Maritime Academy	Thomas College	University of New England	
Dollar Amount of Application:		\$272,200	\$1,153,258	\$1,889,949	
Scoring Sections		Points Available			
Criteria 1: Eligibility and Allowable Uses		Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass
Criteria 2: Proposal		30	17	28	26
Criteria 3: Outcomes and Evaluation		20	7	20	18
Criteria 4: Budget Proposal		20	20	20	15
Criteria 5: Sustainability		30	8	30	14
TOTAL		<u>100</u>	<u>52</u>	<u>98</u>	<u>73</u>



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Pender Makin
Commissioner**

08/02/2023

Maine Maritime Academy
1 Pleasant Street
Castine, ME 04420

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFA # 202302038,
Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

Dear Provost Keith Williamson,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Application (RFA), issued by the State of Maine Department of Education for Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs. The Department has evaluated the applications received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFA, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following applicants:

- Maine Maritime Academy
- Thomas College
- University of New England

All organizations are highly encouraged to review the feedback to their applications. To do this, please view the Selection Package associated with RFA # 202302038 on the State of Maine's Division of Procurement Services website,
<https://www.maine.gov/dafs/bbm/procurementservices/vendors/grants>.

The Department will be contacting the aforementioned applicants soon. Contract negotiations will include, but not be limited to:

- ensuring the federal funding will supplement and not supplant any existing funding
- the total award dollar amount
- appropriate, objective outcomes that inform sustainability efforts
- providing a detailed sustainability plan that:
 - demonstrates the program(s) is highly likely to result in long-term improvement of organizational capacity for supporting Maine's workforce development needs, and
 - integrates the program(s) into the institution's larger, long-term budget

As provided in the RFA, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful applicant.

The applicant shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFA, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFA are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

DocuSigned by:


8798326A52BB412...
Michael T. Perry
Acting Director, Office of Higher Education & Educator Support Services
Maine Department of Education
Michael.T.Perry@maine.gov
207-441-1718

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Pender Makin
Commissioner**

08/02/2023

Thomas College
180 West River Road
Waterville, ME 04901

**SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFA # 202302038,
Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs**

Dear Dr. Kate Borsig,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Application (RFA), issued by the State of Maine Department of Education for Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs. The Department has evaluated the applications received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFA, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following applicants:

- Maine Maritime Academy
- Thomas College
- University of New England

All organizations are highly encouraged to review the feedback to their applications. To do this, please view the Selection Package associated with RFA # 202302038 on the State of Maine's Division of Procurement Services website, <https://www.maine.gov/dafs/bbm/procurementservices/vendors/grants>.

The Department will be contacting the aforementioned applicants soon. Contract negotiations will include, but not be limited to:

- ensuring the federal funding will supplement and not supplant any existing funding
- the total award dollar amount
- appropriate, objective outcomes that inform sustainability efforts
- providing a detailed sustainability plan that:
 - demonstrates the program(s) is highly likely to result in long-term improvement of organizational capacity for supporting Maine's workforce development needs, and
 - integrates the program(s) into the institution's larger, long-term budget

As provided in the RFA, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful applicant.

The applicant shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFA, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFA are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

DocuSigned by:

8798326A52BB412...

Michael T. Perry
Acting Director, Office of Higher Education & Educator Support Services
Maine Department of Education
Michael.T.Perry@maine.gov
207-441-1718

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Pender Makin
Commissioner**

08/02/2023

University of New England
11 Hills Beach Road
Biddeford, ME 04005

**SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFA # 202302038,
Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs**

Dear Marci Bernard,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Application (RFA), issued by the State of Maine Department of Education for Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs. The Department has evaluated the applications received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFA, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following applicants:

- Maine Maritime Academy
- Thomas College
- University of New England

All organizations are highly encouraged to review the feedback to their applications. To do this, please view the Selection Package associated with RFA # 202302038 on the State of Maine's Division of Procurement Services website, <https://www.maine.gov/dafs/bbm/procurementservices/vendors/grants>.

The Department will be contacting the aforementioned applicants soon. Contract negotiations will include, but not be limited to:

- ensuring the federal funding will supplement and not supplant any existing funding
- the total award dollar amount
- appropriate, objective outcomes that inform sustainability efforts
- providing a detailed sustainability plan that:
 - demonstrates the program(s) is highly likely to result in long-term improvement of organizational capacity for supporting Maine's workforce development needs, and
 - integrates the program(s) into the institution's larger, long-term budget

As provided in the RFA, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful applicant.

The applicant shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFA, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFA are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

DocuSigned by:


8798326A52BB412...
Michael T. Perry
Acting Director, Office of Higher Education & Educator Support Services
Maine Department of Education
Michael.T.Perry@maine.gov
207-441-1718

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

Certificate Of Completion

Envelope Id: CF127AF5A8BE40A3B092AF8278BD5DBD	Status: Completed
Subject: omplete with DocuSign: RFA letters	
Source Envelope:	
Document Pages: 9	Signatures: 3
Certificate Pages: 1	Initials: 0
AutoNav: Enabled	Envelope Originator: Natalie Owens natalie.owens@maine.gov
Envelopeld Stamping: Enabled	IP Address: 67.246.60.97
Time Zone: (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada)	

Record Tracking

Status: Original 7/31/2023 12:11:52 PM	Holder: Natalie Owens natalie.owens@maine.gov	Location: DocuSign
Security Appliance Status: Connected	Pool: StateLocal	
Storage Appliance Status: Connected	Pool: Maine Department of Education	Location: DocuSign

Signer Events

Michael Perry
michael.t.perry@maine.gov
Acting Director of the Office of Higher Education and
Educator Supports
Department of Education
Security Level: Email, Account Authentication
(None)

Signature

DocuSigned by:

8798326A52BB412...
Signature Adoption: Uploaded Signature Image
Using IP Address: 198.182.163.113

Timestamp

Sent: 7/31/2023 12:17:46 PM
Resent: 8/2/2023 8:05:53 AM
Viewed: 8/2/2023 9:47:50 AM
Signed: 8/2/2023 9:48:30 AM

Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure:
Not Offered via DocuSign

In Person Signer Events	Signature	Timestamp
-------------------------	-----------	-----------

Editor Delivery Events	Status	Timestamp
------------------------	--------	-----------

Agent Delivery Events	Status	Timestamp
-----------------------	--------	-----------

Intermediary Delivery Events	Status	Timestamp
------------------------------	--------	-----------

Certified Delivery Events	Status	Timestamp
---------------------------	--------	-----------

Carbon Copy Events	Status	Timestamp
--------------------	--------	-----------

Witness Events	Signature	Timestamp
----------------	-----------	-----------

Notary Events	Signature	Timestamp
---------------	-----------	-----------

Envelope Summary Events	Status	Timestamps
-------------------------	--------	------------

Envelope Sent	Hashed/Encrypted	7/31/2023 12:17:46 PM
Certified Delivered	Security Checked	8/2/2023 9:47:50 AM
Signing Complete	Security Checked	8/2/2023 9:48:30 AM
Completed	Security Checked	8/2/2023 9:48:30 AM

Payment Events	Status	Timestamps
----------------	--------	------------

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 07/24/2023

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Education

Name of RFA Coordinator: Michael J Perry

Names of Evaluators: Samantha Dina, Erica C Harris, Joseph Niesen, and Michael J Perry

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Criteria 1. Eligibility and Allowable Uses	X	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Applicant attests to the requirements as outlined in the RFA's Sample Subaward Agreement 	X	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Applicant is a: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • private college or private university in the State of Maine; or • the Maine Maritime Academy 	X	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develops/expands certificate or degree programs that address priority workforce needs identified in the Maine Jobs Plan in one or more of the following industries: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Education; ○ Healthcare and Social Assistance; ○ Construction, Trades, and Logistics; ○ Agriculture, Aquaculture, Fishing and Forestry; ○ Information; ○ Manufacturing; or ○ Clean Energy 	X	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 2. Proposal	30	17
Criteria 3. Outcomes and Evaluation	20	7
Criteria 4. Budget Proposal	20	20
Criteria 5. Sustainability	30	8
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>52</u>

The consensus team noted that the applicant used the 2022 version of this RFA. The applicant's 2023 submission used the 2022 form but updated the RFA number and any dates referencing prior years.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 07/24/2023

Whereas the applicant used the 2022 RFA form, they did not address “how this funding will supplement and not supplant any existing funding for the program(s)”, as requested on the 2023 RFA form. This particular federal funding explicitly states it is to be used to supplement new or existing programs. It was unclear to the consensus team if the applicant’s program currently exists and if the request would supplant existing institutional funds. If the applicant is issued a conditional award, this concern will be prioritized before moving forward.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 07/24/2023

**OVERVIEW OF CRITERIA 1
Preliminary Information**

Criteria 1. Eligibility and Allowable Uses

Evaluation Team Comments:

The postsecondary institution qualified for the Pass/Fail Criteria. They are the Maine Maritime Academy and do qualify for participation addressing workforce and submitting the Sample Subaward Agreement.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 07/24/2023

**EVALUATION OF CRITERIA 2
Proposal**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 2. Proposal	30	17

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Overall, proposal was weak. It was especially lacking in detail of how the applicant will prioritize BIOPOC students and relieve underemployment. There was no connection to the State of Maine’s 10 year Economic Development Strategic Plan or how the proposed plan will advance students and workers to achieve higher paying jobs in Maine.
- The project narrative was sufficient in that it discussed how the trainings/courses would meet fishing industries current needs.
- It was unclear how the trainings/courses would advance the student’s career.
- Hybrid training offerings mentioned but lacked detail on integration.
- Offshore wind and aquaculture stressed
- Reviewers were not convinced how this project was innovative
- Key personnel was provided. However, since the applicant used the 2022 RFA form, they did not provide a list the campus admin that was requested on the 2023 RFA form.
- Whereas the applicant used the 2022 RFA form, they did not “demonstrate funding for one-time investments that will produce lasting benefits and propose a feasible funding strategy for sustaining activities after grant funds have been exhausted” as requested on the 2023 RFA form.
- Whereas the applicant used the 2022 RFA form, they did not “build a case for how the proposed project will address identified needs and increase support of the advancement of students and workers to achieve higher paying jobs in Maine,” as requested on the 2023 RFA form.
- Whereas the applicant used the 2022 RFA form, they did not describe “goals and objectives of the project, including indicators of successful completion, key tasks and benchmarks for successful project completion, key staff and resources, including requested funding, for carrying out project goals,” as requested on the 2023 RFA form.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 07/24/2023

**EVALUATION OF CRITERIA 3
Outcomes and Evaluation**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 3. Outcomes and Evaluation	20	7

Evaluation Team Comments:

- The importance of their safety training/courses was stressed but they did not describe how it will meet the objectives of the RFA.
- 5 outcomes were provided but none included workforce development metrics
- The outcomes provided were indirect and won't generate meaningful measurements, i.e. a collaboration, resources being provided, and alignment with the schools mission would be anecdotal feedback.
- Whereas the applicant used the 2022 RFA form, they did not address "how the project's outcomes will inform sustainability efforts," as requested on the 2023 RFA form.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 07/24/2023

**EVALUATION OF CRITERIA 4
Outcomes and Evaluation**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 4. Budget Proposal	20	20

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Fair, narrative was included, seemed to be based on real estimates
- Cost per trainee was low ~\$1,000 per person
- Appeared cost effective
- Grant is clearly a one-time funding source. Budget was heavily based in personnel.
- Whereas the applicant used the 2022 RFA form, they did not address “how this funding will *supplement and not supplant* any existing funding for the program(s)”, as requested on the 2023 RFA form.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 07/24/2023

**EVALUATION OF CRITERIA 5
Outcomes and Evaluation**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 5. Sustainability	30	8

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Sustainability plan was poorly organized
- Unclear how a student's financial need would be met, i.e. the grant funds or the institution's own funding
- The connection to employers was well underdeveloped. Were current employers of the targeted industry consulted?
- Sustainability model would have been stronger if applicant had industry partnership and demonstrated how enrollment would be met.
- Low-income communities briefly mentioned
- A lack of plan is especially concerning b/c grant is temporary, but the trainings/courses would be mandatory for the student. Team confused if this is an existing mandatory course or new.
- Applicant did lay out how the business cost would be passed on to consumer.
- Unclear if the instructor-related tasks would be performed by existing or new personnel.
- Whereas the applicant used the 2022 RFA form, they did not address "provide evidence that the project is highly likely to create a sustainable, long-term increase in capacity for meeting Maine's workforce development goals. What risks or challenges might hinder success in the goal to make this a long-term, sustainable program? What supports might be needed to mitigate the potential risks?" as requested on the 2023 RFA form.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Thomas College

DATE: 07/24/23

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Education

Name of RFA Coordinator: Michael J Perry

Names of Evaluators: Samantha Dina, Erica C Harris, Joseph Niesen, and Michael J Perry

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Criteria 1. Eligibility and Allowable Uses	X	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Applicant attests to the requirements as outlined in the RFA's Sample Subaward Agreement 	X	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Applicant is a: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • private college or private university in the State of Maine; or • the Maine Maritime Academy 	X	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develops/expands certificate or degree programs that address priority workforce needs identified in the <u>Maine Jobs Plan</u> in one or more of the following industries: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Education; ○ Healthcare and Social Assistance; ○ Construction, Trades, and Logistics; ○ Agriculture, Aquaculture, Fishing and Forestry; ○ Information; ○ Manufacturing; or ○ Clean Energy 	X	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 2. Proposal	30	28
Criteria 3. Outcomes and Evaluation	20	20
Criteria 4. Budget Proposal	20	20
Criteria 5. Sustainability	30	30
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>98</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Thomas College

DATE: 07/24/23

**OVERVIEW OF CRITERIA 1
Preliminary Information**

Criteria 1. Eligibility and Allowable Uses

Evaluation Team Comments:

This postsecondary institution was passed the initial criteria. They qualified because they are a private institution, developed plans addressing the Maine Jobs Plan, and completed the requirements

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Thomas College

DATE: 07/24/23

**EVALUATION OF CRITERIA 2
Proposal**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 2. Proposal	30	28

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Well-developed project plan
- Quality job tying back to Maine's 10 yr plan and stressed growing local talent
- 41% of the institution's students are Pell-eligible, which aligns with the RFA objectives
- Request is to build a chem lab for multiple majors
- Appreciated that this was clearly a one-time funding request
- DOE's educator teacher shortage mentioned
- Appreciated the connection to their Student Success Center mentioned, which was supported with the 2022 grant.
- 150+ more students will be impacted but no faculty mentioned in budget. A little concerned how they'll support more students without additional faculty. Maybe they have alternative funding?

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Thomas College

DATE: 07/24/23

**EVALUATION OF CRITERIA 3
Outcomes and Evaluation**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 3. Outcomes and Evaluation	20	20

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Due to design of program (chem lab), the outcomes were clear, attainable, and realistic.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Thomas College

DATE: 07/24/23

**EVALUATION OF CRITERIA 4
Outcomes and Evaluation**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 4. Budget Proposal	20	20

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Clearly laid out how dollars will support the duties listed
- Matching funds demonstrated to Team that applicant has clear “buy-in” and institutionally invested in the long term success of the investment
- Appreciated that the indirect costs were included in their matching funds
- Clearly cost competitive

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: Thomas College

DATE: 07/24/23

**EVALUATION OF CRITERIA 5
Outcomes and Evaluation**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 5. Sustainability	30	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Needs assessment based on fact that 700 students currently share the existing lab, which emphasized lab will be used for years to come.
- Building's maintenance and upkeep detailed and thought out
- A solid sustainability plan since this is a one-time funding request

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: University of New England

DATE: 07/24/23

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Education

Name of RFA Coordinator: Michael J Perry

Names of Evaluators: Samantha Dina, Erica C Harris, Joseph Niesen, and Michael J Perry

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Criteria 1. Eligibility and Allowable Uses		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Applicant attests to the requirements as outlined in the RFA's Sample Subaward Agreement 	X	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Applicant is a: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • private college or private university in the State of Maine; or • the Maine Maritime Academy 	X	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develops/expands certificate or degree programs that address priority workforce needs identified in the Maine Jobs Plan in one or more of the following industries: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Education; ○ Healthcare and Social Assistance; ○ Construction, Trades, and Logistics; ○ Agriculture, Aquaculture, Fishing and Forestry; ○ Information; ○ Manufacturing; or ○ Clean Energy 	X	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 2. Proposal	30	26
Criteria 3. Outcomes and Evaluation	20	18
Criteria 4. Budget Proposal	20	15
Criteria 5. Sustainability	30	14
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>73</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: University of New England

DATE: 07/24/23

**OVERVIEW OF CRITERIA 1
Preliminary Information**

Criteria 1. Eligibility and Allowable Uses

Evaluation Team Comments:

This postsecondary institution was passed the initial criteria. They qualified because they are a private institution, developed plans addressing the Maine Jobs Plan, and completed the requirements

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: University of New England

DATE: 07/24/23

**EVALUATION OF CRITERIA 2
Proposal**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 2. Proposal	30	26

Evaluation Team Comments:

- 14 new well-paid positions will support 35 newly trained physicians. Grant funds would pay for 6 well-paid positions.
- It was appreciated how applicant was cognizant of and stressed Maine's need for rural area healthcare providers. Applicant referenced Maine's 10 yr. plan's which includes increasing the availability of quality medical care.
- Team discussed concerns of retaining an influx of recent graduates and the likelihood they could stay in Maine. Does Maine have the residency spots to keep them in Maine? Will we be creating a bottle neck?
- Applicant addressed RFA's goal to prioritize diverse populations and low-income students. 30% of the institution's students are first generation and 17% of all students self-identify as BIPOC.
- Applicant explained how this grant will expand their long-term plan. Their medical program is moving from Biddeford to Portland. The expanding teacher program will use current Biddeford medical buildings.
- Team didn't appreciate the very extensive information about App's overall business development plan. A condensed version would have been better.
- Team would have like to have seen an elaborate strategy for how they'll recruit the 14 new professionals, especially those at the Ph. D career level.
- Key personnel were provided and appeared appropriate.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: University of New England

DATE: 07/24/23

**EVALUATION OF CRITERIA 3
Outcomes and Evaluation**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 3. Outcomes and Evaluation	20	18

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Outcomes tied to students completing program and continuing to work in Maine
- Team concerned if Maine’s industry has the clinical statewide capacity to hire 35 more physicians
- Outcomes were clear and based on data from alumni tracking

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: University of New England

DATE: 07/24/23

**EVALUATION OF CRITERIA 4
Outcomes and Evaluation**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 4. Budget Proposal	20	15

Evaluation Team Comments:

- The costs seemed reasonable for 6 highly trained positions. However, a detailed break out per position would have been appreciated and may have increased this score. 6 positions = \$1.2M but the positions aren't all the same (mix of faculty and staff).
- 42% indirect rate was very high. If awarded, the indirect rate usage will need to be reviewed. The rate may have been overapplied to certain direct costs. I.E., should the recruitment costs be included in the indirect cost rate?
- Based on 35 students and grant is 1.3 million = \$30K per student. How will underserved students pay for this after the grant ends?
- Was there a typo about June 2025 in the narrative? The start date and end date are both June 2025.
- Very concerned how they'll recruit and hire 6 people ASAP given that the funding must be obligated by 12/31/2024.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT: University of New England

DATE: 07/24/23

**EVALUATION OF CRITERIA 5
Outcomes and Evaluation**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Criteria 5. Sustainability	30	14

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Plan was provided. The institution's plan to sustain the costs of the expanded program is solely based on passing costs along to students. A low score was issued because the plan seemed to be in direct contradiction to goal of RFA to develop opportunities for low-income students.
- Very poor plan and based on increased revenue from tuition and fees.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: July 21, 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Sam Dina

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Labor

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Eligibility and Allowable Uses (pass/fail)

- Is the applicant eligible to apply?

Yes/No

- Does the proposal develop a new or expanded program in one or more of these industries: education; healthcare and social assistance; construction, trades, and logistics; agriculture, aquaculture, fishing & forestry; information; manufacturing; and/or clean energy?

Yes/No

II. Proposal

- Focused on safety for fisherman
- Don't understand how this advances goals in 10 yr plan
- No mention of priority communities—other than young adults through career fairs
- Does this credential translate to additional pay? Create additional economic opportunities?
- Is this a new offering or building capacity of existing offering?
- Mention of connection to apprenticeship but would like to see stronger connection to career advancement

III. Outcomes and Evaluation

- Mention of connection to offshore wind is important
- Evaluation points to training feedback via surveys but doesn't discuss outcomes related to participation, priority communities, employment results or wage gains—or anything related to decreased hazards or increased safety for staff and crews

IV. Budget Proposal

- \$272,000 total
- Majority in new instructional capacity
- Salaries at \$45k plus fringe—a little low for salaries, difficult to imagine retention
- Unclear if this is building additional trainer capacity?

V. Sustainability

- Didn't spell out how they will sustain this program
- Did mention that the cost of training can be barrier to new entrants and therefore will use this funding to offer free or reduced costs

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 07/21/23

EVALUATOR NAME: Erica C Harris

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Executive Department

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Eligibility and Allowable Uses (pass/fail)

- Is the applicant eligible to apply?

Yes/No

- Does the proposal develop a new or expanded program in one or more of these industries: education; healthcare and social assistance; construction, trades, and logistics; agriculture, aquaculture, fishing & forestry; information; manufacturing; and/or clean energy?

Yes/No

II. Proposal

- Background into the danger of commercial fishing
- Goals:
 - Assist ppl in fishing/aquaculture industry in maintaining culture of safety
 - Provide training for job safety/survival at sea
 - USCG approved courses - Master
- P - Cross training/upskilling opportunity for recreational charter/Ferry opps (outside of the scope of RFP)
- I – 240 trainees in 12 months, from fishing communities, local high schools, career fairs
- Q – how many hours would the course be? – 9 hrs (microcredential?)
- N – unclear how the course could be used to further education/get a credential
- N – no mention of target communities
- Q – how connected to 10 year plan?
- P – online component/hybrid/expand access
- Q – is this supplementing existing programming? Is it new programming?

III. Outcomes and Evaluation

- Exit assessments
- Overseen by USCG
- Q – WF development metrics? Job placements?
- Q – would trainees receive college credit from MMA? Or equivalency? Open to current MMA students?

IV. Budget Proposal

- \$240K personnel
- 2 FTE instructors

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 07/21/23

EVALUATOR NAME: Erica C Harris

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Executive Department

- Transpo for job fairs
- Budget narrative:
 - Included
- Includes development of new textbook/manual

V. Sustainability

- Training is mandatory and can be a financial burden
- To be offered at a cost of \$150-\$200 with scholarships
- Course hours varying from 9 to 56, fee for service with scholarships available
- Offer as “portable,” blended online and practicals
- Unclear how staffing levels will be maintained – would like to have seen a more detailed accounting of anticipated revenue from course fees

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 7/21/23

EVALUATOR NAME: Joe Niesen

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Economic & Community Development

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Eligibility and Allowable Uses (pass/fail)

- Is the applicant eligible to apply?

Yes

- Does the proposal develop a new or expanded program in one or more of these industries: education; healthcare and social assistance; construction, trades, and logistics; agriculture, aquaculture, fishing & forestry; information; manufacturing; and/or clean energy?

Yes

II. Proposal

- N- Proposal does not adequately address the stated goals of the project. It does not address how the course ties into the 10-year economic development strategy, prioritize supports for BIPOC and underrepresented communities, address unemployment, or demonstrate how the program will lead to increased pay for students and workers.
- N- Proposal is general with little beyond the need for safety in fishing as a justification for the award.

III. Outcomes and Evaluation

- P-The objectives and importance of the training to be offered are clear.
- N-The objectives and goals do not tie back to the goals of the grant program as described in the project overview.
- N-There is no description of the current enrollment numbers despite the claim that the training is mandatory (p. 5). Indeed, the statement that "Safety and survival training is not optional," there is little support for this and there is nothing indicating how the current level of training is insufficient.

IV. Budget Proposal

- P-Cost proposed is low and budget narrative is reasonable.
- Q-There is a statement that "We foresee this training to be offered at a cost of \$150-200 or complimentary, should there be financial need," but there is no indication of how the costs would be covered by these funds. Would the complimentary courses be covered by revenue from paying students?
- Q-Is this offering new? If not, what is the current spending?

V. Sustainability

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 7/21/23

EVALUATOR NAME: Joe Niesen

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Economic & Community Development

- N-Sustainability model proposed does not have enough information or guarantee that the program would be self-sustaining following the close of this project.
- Q-It is inferred that that there will be employer engagement as part of the sustained offering of this training, does the applicant have statements from employers showing that this training is something desired by the industry?
- What is the plan to evaluate the effectiveness of the training?

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 20 July 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Michael T. Perry

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Education

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Eligibility and Allowable Uses (pass/fail)

- Is the applicant eligible to apply?

Yes/No

- Does the proposal develop a new or expanded program in one or more of these industries: education; healthcare and social assistance; construction, trades, and logistics; **agriculture, aquaculture, fishing & forestry**; information; manufacturing; and/or clean energy?

Yes/No

II. Proposal

- Addresses “fishing” directly and “clean energy” indirectly (offshore wind) as critical needs.
- Implies that students will come primarily from fishing communities, which tend to be low-income and rural; further mentions possible free training for those with financial need. Proposal includes job fair outreach and other marketing to increase participation.
- One of the two training programs (Vessel Drill Conductor Course) can be taken “on the road” to meet community members who may not be able to travel to primary site in Bucksport, ME.
- Certification and licensure from this training could lead to careers in lobstering, fishing, ferrying, and maritime hospitality (e.g. whale watching, harbor tours).
- Specific instructors are identified, although certifications are not necessarily addressed.

III. Outcomes and Evaluation

- Training programs will be overseen by US Coast Guard (through their review/approval of MMA’s Center for Mariner Professional Development, or CPMD. This is an indirect form of oversight.)
- Exit assessments are required of each participant to ensure they pass the requirements of the training course; this will be taken as evidence of the effectiveness of the instruction. (Instructors will themselves assess whether trainees meet the criteria.)

IV. Budget Proposal

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Maine Maritime Academy

DATE: 20 July 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Michael T. Perry

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Education

- \$240,000 for two instructors' salary/benefits for two years.
- \$20,000 for developing/preparing course materials.
- \$5,000 for marketing/promotion.
- \$7,200 for transportation as part of "on the road" trainings.

V. Sustainability

- Developed materials can be then used for trainings on ongoing basis.
- Fees for trainings will fund program on ongoing basis.
- Establishing a portable/hybrid model for these trainings will help ensure ongoing interest/participants in future years.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Thomas College

DATE: July 21, 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Sam Dina

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Labor

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Eligibility and Allowable Uses (pass/fail)

- Is the applicant eligible to apply?

Yes/No

- Does the proposal develop a new or expanded program in one or more of these industries: education; healthcare and social assistance; construction, trades, and logistics; agriculture, aquaculture, fishing & forestry; information; manufacturing; and/or clean energy?

Yes/No

II. Proposal

- Connection between COVID affected industries: additional training for science teachers—aligned with teacher shortage areas
- Clear description of how college currently serves target audience—low income, first gen
- High placement rate w/ jobs
- Supports 10 yr plan—connection with workforce attraction—keeping students in Maine
- Is this funding expanded student success center support or just lab?
- Additional 115 students each year—unsure how that wont result in need for more faculty

III. Outcomes and Evaluation

- Clearly defined outcomes include increased courses, increased student enrollment

IV. Budget Proposal

- Allocating matching funds
- Low in terms of staff costs

V. Sustainability

- One-time investment
- Identified needs assessment as interest to continue the expansion to chemistry based on student interests

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Thomas College

DATE: 07/21/23

EVALUATOR NAME: Erica C Harris

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Executive Department

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Eligibility and Allowable Uses (pass/fail)

- Is the applicant eligible to apply?

Yes/No

- Does the proposal develop a new or expanded program in one or more of these industries: education; healthcare and social assistance; construction, trades, and logistics; agriculture, aquaculture, fishing & forestry; information; manufacturing; and/or clean energy?

Yes/No

II. Proposal

- Expansion project to incr post-sec credentials
- Increase student access – chem lab, two lab prep/research pace
- P – refers to 10 year plan’s plan to grow local talent
- P – onetime funds
- Rural-serving institution, 41% Pell-eligible
- Expand psych, edu, health, bio, CJ
- Only 4-year institution in ME w/o a chem lab
- Science course demand is increasing
- Would increase/expand access to science courses
- Would drive more enrollment in STEM, overall enrollment
- Project design:
 - Renovate 1400 sf of existing
 - P – lays out all academic programs that would benefit, including many in focus areas outlined in RFP
 - Plan includes specific classroom

III. Outcomes and Evaluation

- Clear objectives, baseline, and targets
- Timeline set for construction and deliverables
- Doubles Thomas’ capacity to offer lab-based science courses and new certifications/majors

IV. Budget Proposal

- \$1.153 total request
- Most funds go to construction and equipment, with some reserved for staffing
- Anticipation of \$236K in matching funds

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Thomas College

DATE: 07/21/23

EVALUATOR NAME: Erica C Harris

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Executive Department

- Detailed construction and equipment cost breakdown

V. *Sustainability*

- One-time investment aligns with goals of RFP
- No additional staffing/funding needs beyond the term of the grant

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Thomas College

DATE: 7/21/23

EVALUATOR NAME: Joe Niesen

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Economic & Community Development

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Eligibility and Allowable Uses (pass/fail)

- Is the applicant eligible to apply?

Yes

- Does the proposal develop a new or expanded program in one or more of these industries: education; healthcare and social assistance; construction, trades, and logistics; agriculture, aquaculture, fishing & forestry; information; manufacturing; and/or clean energy?

Yes

II. Proposal

- P-Project proposal clearly ties back to the priorities outlined in the Maine 10-year Economic Development Plan. Specifically growing local talent.
- P-Proposal acknowledges the intent of the program to support the advancement of students and workers to achieve higher paying jobs in Maine.
- Q-How does the creation of a chemistry lab affect those studying strength training or psychology? Some of the suggested increases seem a little outside the direct impact that a new lab would have.
- P-Project design is comprehensive and well developed.
- P-Thomas college will provide \$236,737 in matching (20%) which is clearly broken out. This demonstrates the entity's commitment to the project success.

III. Outcomes and Evaluation

- P-Goals and objectives are clear, attainable, and measurable.
- P-Timeline is clear with solid deliverables and milestones.

IV. Budget Proposal

- Budget is reasonable and clearly delineated in the proposal.

V. Sustainability

- This is acknowledged as a one-time infrastructure investment. The resulting programs and offerings of the university will be sustained through regular scholastic offerings.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Thomas College

DATE: 20 July 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Michael T. Perry

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Education

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Eligibility and Allowable Uses (pass/fail)

- Is the applicant eligible to apply?

Yes/No

- Does the proposal develop a new or expanded program in one or more of these industries: **education; healthcare and social assistance**; construction, trades, and logistics; agriculture, aquaculture, fishing & forestry; information; manufacturing; and/or clean energy?

Yes/No

II. Proposal

- Program addresses critical needs in education and healthcare & social assistance through the creation of a chemistry lab and the expansion of lab-based courses, degrees, and certifications.
- Program specifically targets “Pell-eligible [41.6% of student body in Fall 2022], low-income [98% of student body received financial aid in Fall 2022], and first-generation students [self-designation of 48% in Fall 2022]”. Programing is included through the Student Success Center and Peer-Led Team Learning to assist “disadvantaged students”. Rurality is also addressed, where “73% of Thomas College graduates stay in Maine and work in Maine” and the college is “classified as a rural-serving instruction”.
- A list of new programming, including new/expanded EPP offerings in the sciences; new majors and minors in the sciences, including Psychology; and expanded programming in Conservation Law and Criminal Justice/Forensics.
- Key personnel are provided, along with their specific credentials.

III. Outcomes and Evaluation

- Five specific outcomes are provided, each with targets (and baselines, where appropriate).
- For each outcome, a reporting mechanism and is identified along with a timeline for completion and person(s) responsible.

IV. Budget Proposal

- \$46,299 Personnel salary/benefits [expressed as FTEs for each personnel]
- \$201,750 Instructional materials and supplies [itemized in Appendix 2]
- \$10,000 Contracted services – namely, a practicing chemist to consult
- \$869,209 Infrastructure [cost breakdown in Appendix 1]

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Thomas College

DATE: 20 July 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Michael T. Perry

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Education

- Thomas College will provide \$236,737 in matching funds.

V. *Sustainability*

- Majority of funding is a one-time infrastructure project which will allow for ongoing programming.
- Enrollment in lab-based courses will continue to fund programming in years beyond the grant proposal.
- Applicant shares that a needs assessment “clearly identified significant gaps in our current capacity to meet student demand for lab-based courses”.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: University of New England

DATE: July 21, 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Sam Dina

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Labor

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Eligibility and Allowable Uses (pass/fail)

- Is the applicant eligible to apply?

Yes/No

- Does the proposal develop a new or expanded program in one or more of these industries: education; healthcare and social assistance; construction, trades, and logistics; agriculture, aquaculture, fishing & forestry; information; manufacturing; and/or clean energy?

Yes/No

II. Proposal

- 14 positions and 35 more physicians annually
- Digital health & rural healthcare delivery capacity
- With more physicians in training—do we have residency spots to keep them in Maine?
- Mentions recruitment of under-represented communities—and like that they've increased this in recent year including an articulation agreement w/ HBCU
- Would like more detail on their recruitment plans in the future years
- Capacity will help facilitate the move to the campus and enhance ability to coordinate interprofessional rotations

III. Outcomes and Evaluation

- Faculty positions, students, credential doctors
- Mention of tracking alumni outcomes based on where people work

IV. Budget Proposal

- 42% indirect rate seems incredibly high—nearly \$600k
- Cost per student is really high—nearly \$30k
- Nearly \$1.3 M in staffing—roles make sense—clinical faculty & recruiter

V. Sustainability

- Tuition generated by more faculty will cover salaries—makes me think they are creating barriers to individuals who may face barriers

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: University of New England

DATE: 07/21/23

EVALUATOR NAME: Erica C Harris

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Executive Department

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Eligibility and Allowable Uses (pass/fail)

- Is the applicant eligible to apply?

Yes/No

- Does the proposal develop a new or expanded program in one or more of these industries: education; healthcare and social assistance; construction, trades, and logistics; agriculture, aquaculture, fishing & forestry; information; manufacturing; and/or clean energy?

Yes/No

II. Proposal

- 10 year plan – add 75K new workers
- Expanded program will result in 35+ physicians annually
 - 14 positions
- Q – funds will be used for staffing?
- Q – adequate residency spots?
- Focus on recruiting from underserved communities
- Build IT infrastructure
- Construction – expand class enrollment
- P – first gen are 30% of undergrad
- P – rural medicine focus
- Identifies need for addl' medical providers, especially PCPs
- Q – what will the funds be used for?
 - Describes COM investment (significantly more than the grant funds)
 - Costs per hire > \$7K per position

III. Outcomes and Evaluation

- Number of positions added
- Clinical capacity? Will ME clinics have the space to accommodate 35+ additional med students for rotations?
- Eval: increasing COM class size, recruiting
- Tracking of students' progression through medical field
 - Tracking if graduates live and work in ME
- P – clearly described outcomes

IV. Budget Proposal

- \$1,288,950 total request

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: University of New England

DATE: 07/21/23

EVALUATOR NAME: Erica C Harris

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Executive Department

- Costs go to salary and benefits of fac/staff for one year
- Recruiting and relocation costs
- V. *Sustainability*
 - Increased salary costs will be folded into operating budget, offset by increased tuition/fees from new students

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: Thomas College

DATE: 7/21/23

EVALUATOR NAME: Joe Niesen

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Economic & Community Development

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Eligibility and Allowable Uses (pass/fail)

- Is the applicant eligible to apply?

Yes

- Does the proposal develop a new or expanded program in one or more of these industries: education; healthcare and social assistance; construction, trades, and logistics; agriculture, aquaculture, fishing & forestry; information; manufacturing; and/or clean energy?

Yes

II. Proposal

- P-Proposal is clearly tied to the economic development plan, particularly part A: Grow local talent. The expansion of the UNE campus in Portland will provide a means for attracting medical professionals to the State for both education and employment.
- P-Proposal is well researched and ties nicely in to the economic direction the State is taking.
- P-UNE's has a demonstrable history of placing a priority on the recruitment and enrollment of traditionally underserved populations.

III. Outcomes and Evaluation

- P-Outcomes described in the proposal are clear and reasonable.
- Described evaluation is standard for such a program.

IV. Budget Proposal

- Q-Would it be possible to see a breakout of how the personnel costs will be applied?
- Q-Should recruitment costs be included in the calculation of Modified Indirect Costs? Current budget lists indirect costs as a percentage of personnel and recruitment costs.
- Q-The indirect rate being used is calculated using the Off-campus rate. Is this correct? If the building and staff to be hired will be working on campus, would they not be considered 'on-campus?'

V. Sustainability

- P-Positions identified in the agreement are expected to be sustained through normal operational costs associated with UNE.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: University of New England

DATE: 20 July 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Michael T. Perry

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Education

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Eligibility and Allowable Uses (pass/fail)

- Is the applicant eligible to apply?

Yes/No

- Does the proposal develop a new or expanded program in one or more of these industries: **education; healthcare and social assistance**; construction, trades, and logistics; agriculture, aquaculture, fishing & forestry; information; manufacturing; and/or clean energy?

Yes/No

II. Proposal

- Addresses labor shortage in healthcare/social assistance; ~14 additional faculty members to serve as educators in the state; and the 10-year strategic plan's inclusion of access to healthcare as a determining factor in workforce attraction.
- Identified services to first-generation students (30% of UNE undergraduates) and self-identifying students of color (17%) as key targeted demographics. (UNE COM has "recently experience a 117 percent increase in students who identify as underrepresented in medicine".)
- Applicant also points to rural-serving doctors who come out of their program: 53% who complete training in Maine community hospitals return to practice there later; 75-80% of those who complete their residency in Maine stay.
- Physicians earn upwards of \$200k in Maine, higher than the typical Maine worker.
- One-time investment of funds will boost hiring efforts to launch Center for Interprofessional Education and Practice at UNE's Portland campus, which will build enrollment capacity by 21+% and fund further expansion of programming.
- Key personnel are identified, along with their credentials.

III. Outcomes and Evaluation

- UNE will increase its COM enrollment through the expansion of its faculty roster supported by this grant.
- Increased COM student enrollment will "significantly enhance UNE's ability to coordinate and expand interprofessional rotations throughout Maine healthcare sites, an important step in measuring the most effective interprofessional interventions for patient care".
- Alumni office will track employment outcomes of students completing their training in the newly-expanded COM.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

APPLICANT NAME: University of New England

DATE: 20 July 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Michael T. Perry

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Education

- Measures/reportable data is not always clear in the assertions in this section.

IV. Budget Proposal

- \$1,288,950 Salary and Benefits for new faculty, in place by June 2025.
- \$558,999 Overhead charged at 42 percent indirect cost rate.
- \$42,000 Estimated cost of recruiting, relocating six new faculty and staff. (\$70k per hire)

V. Sustainability

- Increased faculty roster will lead to increased enrollment, covering faculty salary after grant period has ended.
- Faculty salary will become part of UNE's regular operating budget.



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Pender Makin
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

I, Samantha Dina, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Applications (RFA) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Education. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted an application to this RFA.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose applications I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any applications submitted in response to this RFA nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Applications presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

DocuSigned by:
Samantha Dina
780320D71BC1426...
Signature

7/6/2023
Date



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Pender Makin
Commissioner**

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFA #: 202302038**

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

I, Erica Harris, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Applications (RFA) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Education. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted an application to this RFA.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose applications I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any applications submitted in response to this RFA nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Applications presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

DocuSigned by:
Erica C Harris
09890F2F26CB460...
Signature

7/6/2023
Date



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Pender Makin
Commissioner**

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFA #: 202302038**

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

I, Joseph Niesen, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Applications (RFA) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Education. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted an application to this RFA.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose applications I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any applications submitted in response to this RFA nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Applications presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

DocuSigned by:
Joseph L Niesen
BE3A3BA8F420402...
Signature

7/6/2023
Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Pender Makin
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFA #: 202302038

RFA TITLE: Higher Education Workforce Grants New or Expanded Programs

I, Michael Perry, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Applications (RFA) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Education. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted an application to this RFA.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose applications I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any applications submitted in response to this RFA nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Applications presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

DocuSigned by:

7/14/2023

0790320A52BD412...
Signature

Date